INTERNET GOVERNANCE FORUM

Multistakeholder Advisory Group Meeting

Geneva, 23 November 2010

Summary Report

1   The Multistakeholder Advisory Group (MAG) met in Geneva on 23 November 2010. The discussion focused on its composition and on its functioning as mandated by the Secretary-General[1].

2.   The MAG decided to open its meeting to observers and make its proceedings available in the form of a live text streaming. This verbatim record is available on the IGF Web site. This proceeding is recommended for future meetings in order to enhance the openness and transparency of its work. However, the MAG retains the possibility of having closed meeting segments and of making remarks off the record under the Chatham House rule.

3. The session built on the discussions of the open consultations held on 22 November 2010. A paper prepared by the Secretariat synthesizing comments that had been submitted on a questionnaire prepared by the MAG served as the main input to those consultations. The questionnaire contained the following questions:

- (a)   has the work of the MAG been consistent with the mandate set out in the Tunis Agenda and subsequent decisions?
- (b)   how best to nominate non governmental members for the MAG?
- (c)   how best to nominate the MAG Chair?
- (d)   how best to organize open consultations?
- (e)   how best to link with regional meetings?
- (f)   how best to link with international processes and institutions?

4.   The MAG confirmed the general sentiment expressed in the consultations, namely that its work had been consistent with the mandate set out in the Tunis Agenda. The MAG recommended the continuation of a multistakeholder body that would serve as a de-facto bureau to steer the IGF process, ensuring multistakeholder participation, and to prepare the annual IGF meetings. The IGF and MAG are supported by a Secretariat headed by an Executive Coordinator and reporting to the Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA) through its division for Public Administration and Development Management.

5.   As a concrete next step, the MAG recommended that its mandate be renewed for another year with a suitable rotation of its members, taking note of their past contributions to the IGF work.

6.   There was general agreement that, in principle, a third of all MAG members should be rotated every year, setting a *de facto* three year limit to each member's term. However, it was understood that this principle might need to be implemented in a flexible manner.

7.   The MAG also discussed improvements of its working methods. One suggestion was to identify modalities for improved input into the consultations and MAG meetings

8.   The discussions focused on the function and role of the MAG and the job description of the MAG members. In the past, the MAGs main functions were:
- • Setting the agenda for the annual IGF meeting;
- • Overall Programme development and support function;
- • Outreach.

9.   Specific tasks performed by the MAG members include:

- Developing the detailed programme including the identification of issues of concern;
- Selecting workshops and other meetings;
- Defining how best to plan and organize the meetings;
- Organizing main sessions and where necessary participate in dedicated thematic working groups;
- Establishing linkages between workshops and main sessions;
- Facilitating the organization of workshops;
- Coordinating panels and supporting panellists, moderators and speakers at the annual meeting;
- Liaising with their respective communities;
- Publishing reports.

10.   The commitments of individual MAG members, in their individual capacities, include:
- Attend three meetings in Geneva per year;
- Participate in the yearly meeting;
- Participate in intersessional work;
- Make outreach to wider community, including national and regional IGF type initiatives and bring other networks into the MAG:
- Bring in comments from the community,
- Explain recommendations to the community.

11.   Among the criteria for selection of non-governmental MAG members, the following qualifications and competencies were felt to be essential:
- Willingness to commit to work and follow through;
- Proven ability to work as a team member;
- Active participation in the IGF process;
- Extensive linkages within one's own stakeholder group and, if possible, to other stakeholder groups;
- Experience and expertise in Internet governance issues.

12.   The MAG discussed at some length the selections process for MAG members. It was generally felt that the so-called 'black box' approach used in past should not be pursued in the future as it was not sufficiently transparent. While for the selection of governmental MAG members there were well established processes in place trough the regional groups, the selection of non governmental members needed further reflection.

13.   The MAG recommended maintaining the private sector, civil society and the technical community as separate stakeholder groups. It recognized that all of the stakeholder groups where organized differently and where based on different cultures and should therefore be allowed to develop their own specific selection procedures.

14.   There was a first discussion on the selection process. One possibility mentioned was a form of 'triage' that would be used to ensure appropriate geographical balance among MAG members. This 'triage' could be carried out by a trusted group of former non-governmental MAG members, perhaps including some MAG members who are being rotated out. This trusted group would work in active consultation with the respective stakeholder groups. The selection would be based on proposed candidate lists made by the three non-governmental stakeholder groups. The stakeholder groups are encouraged to nominate a sufficiently large slate of candidates to provide some flexibility in selection of MAG members and are asked to ensure appropriate gender balance.

15.   The recommendation would then be submitted to the Secretary-General for approval. One proposal was that the list of all MAG nominees to be submitted to the Secretary-General should be published on the IGF website.

16.   The above selection procedure is recommended for the upcoming renewal as recommended in paragraph 5.

MAG MEETING
23 November 2010

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Name	Position
MAG Members	
Mr. Al Shatti, Qusai	Kuwait City - Deputy Chairman of Kuwait Information Technology Society
Ms. Arida, Christine	Cairo - Director of Telecom Planning and Services, National Telecom Regulatory Authority, Egypt
Mr. Bajwa, Fouad	Lahore – Social Entrepreneur
Mr. Dardailler, Daniel	Nice - Associate Chair for Europe, World Wide Web Consortium (W3C)
Ms. Dryden, Heather	Ottawa - Senior Advisor, International Telecommunications Policy and Coordination, Telecommunications Policy Branch, Industry Canada
Mr. Galvani, Alvaro	Brasilia - Head, Division of Information Society, Ministry of External Relations
Mr. Graham, Bill	Ottawa - Global Strategic Engagement, Internet Society (ISOC)
Ms. Hassan, Ayesha	Paris - Senior Policy Manager, E-Business, IT, and Telecoms, Executive in charge of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) Policy, International Chamber of Commerce (ICC)
Mr. Hilali, Abdelaziz	Rabat - Professor, Institut Supérieur des Télécommunications de Rabat ; President, Internet Society Morocco
Ms. Hofmann, Jeanette	London - Senior Researcher, London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE) / Social Science Research Center Berlin
Mr. Katundu, Michael	Nairobi - Assistant Director, Information Technology Communications Commission, Kenya
Ms. Murrey-Bruce, Freda Ruth	Abuja - Senior Manager, Strategy & Monitoring, Nigerian Communications Commission
Ms. Nimpuno, Nurani	Stockholm - Outreach & Communications, Netnod/Autonomica
Mr. Papadatos, George	Geneva - Minister-Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Greece to the United Nations Office at Geneva
Ms. Pereda, Katitza Rodriguez	Washington, DC – Director of EPIC´s International Privacy Project and Coordinator of The Public Voice Coalition
Ms. Selaimen, Graciela	Rio de Janeiro - Executive Coordinator, Núcleo de Pesquisas, Estudos e Formação (NUPEF)
Mr. Siganga, Waudo	Nairobi – Computer Society of Kenya, Chair

Mr. Solines Moreno, Juan Carlos	Quito - Solines & Asociados Abogados, Partner; Professor of Technology & Law and Telecommunications Law, San Francisco de Quito University (USFQ)
Ms. Swinehart, Theresa	Washington, DC - Director, Global Internet Policy, Verizon Communications
Ms. Taylor, Emily	Oxford - Consultant
Ms. Warren, Jennifer A.	Alexandria, VA - Vice President, Technology Policy & Regulation, Lockheed Martin Corporation
Members participating remotely	
Ms. Betancourt, Valeria	Quito - Coordinator of the Communication and Information Policy Programme in Latin America, Association for Progressive Communications (APC)
Mr. Disspain, Chris	Carlton - Chief Executive Officer, AU Registry; Chair, Council of Country-Code Names Supporting Organization (ccNSO)
Mr. Echeberría, Raúl	Montevideo - Executive Director/CEO, Latin American and Caribbean Internet Addresses Registry (LACNIC)
Inter-Governmental Organizations and the European Commission	
Ms. Hu, Xianhong	UNESCO
Ms. Thaçi, Elvana	Council of Europe
Ms. Markot, Elisabeth	European Commission
Regional Coordinators	
Mr. Schneider, Thomas	WEOG (Switzerland)
Advisors to the Chair	
Mr. Fältström, Patrik	Stockholm - Consulting Engineer, Cisco Systems; Member, Board of Internet Society; Member, Swedish Government IT Advisory Group
Mr. Glaser, Hartmut	São Paulo - CEO, CGI.Br
Mr. Kleinwächter, Wolfgang	Aarhus – Professor, International Communication Policy and Regulation, University of Aarhus
Mr. Singh, Parminder Jeet	Bangalore – Executive Director, IT for Change
Advisors to the Chair participating remotely	
Ms. Shaw, Heather	New York – Director, International Telecommunications and Information Policy, United

	States Council for International Business
Others	
Mr. Aizu, Izumi	Tokyo - Coordinator, Internet Governance Caucus
Mr. Alcaine, Miguel A	Geneva – Member, Internet Governance Caucus
Mr. Battesti, Anton'Maria	Paris – Gouvernance de l'Internet, Sous-direction de l'audiovisuel extérieur et des technologies de communication, Ministère des Affaires Étrangères et Européennes, Government of France
Ms. Borisova, Iren	Washington, DC – Senior Manager, International Public Policy, Verisign
Ms. Cade, Marilyn	Washington, DC - Principal and CEO, mCADE LLC
Mr. Drake, William	Geneva - Senior associate, Centre for International Governance, Graduate Institute of International Studies
Ms. El Saadany, Nermine	Cairo – Director, International Relations Division, MCIT, Government of Egypt
Mr. Esmat, Baher	Cairo – Manager, Regional Relations Middle East, ICANN
Ms. Estherhuysen, Anriette	Johannesburg – Executive Director, Association for Progressive Communications
Ms. Forest, Johanne	Geneva – First Secretary, Permanent Mission of Canada
Ms. Gad, Nashwa	Cairo – Department Manager, International Relations Division, WSIS and Internet Affairs
Mr. Hassan, Yasser	Geneva – Counsellor, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Permanent Mission of Egypt to the United Nations.
Mr. La Chapelle, Bertrand de	Paris – Program Director, International Diplomatic Academy
Mr. Ludwig, Wolf	Neuchâtel – Chair, EURALO
Mr. Major, Peter	Permanente Mission of Hungary
Mr. Mazzone, Giacomo	Geneva - European Broadcasting Union
Mr. Musgrave, Shawn Andre	Geneva – Intern, Geneva Social Observatory
Ms. Pandey, Tulika	New Delhi – Additional Director, MCIT, Government of India
Mr. Shcherbovich, Andrey	Moscow – Researcher, State University, Higher School of Economics
Mr. Souter, David	Kent – Managing Director, ict Development Associates Ltd
Ms. Waterbley, Séverine	Brussels - Adviser, Directorate-General for Telecommunications and the Information Society
Mr. Yadav, Manhersinh	Geneva – Third Secretary, Permanent Mission of India to the United Nations
Mr. Zuck, Jonathan	Brussels – President, Association for Competitive Technology
Secretariat	
Mr. Kummer, Markus	Executive Coordinator, IGF Secretariat

Mr. Acquaro, Vincenzo	Chief, e-Government Branch, Division for Public Administration and Development Management, Department of Economic and Social Affairs
Mr. Masango, Chengetai	Programme and Technology Manager
Ms. Doria, Avri	Consultant
Mr. Schulman, Kyle	Consultant
Mr. Arata, Seiiti	Intern