

**Internet Governance Forum**  
**Multi-stakeholder Advisory Group Meeting (MAG)**  
**Paris, 1 March 2013**  
**Summary Report**

1. The Multi-stakeholder Advisory Group (MAG) met in Paris on 1 March 2013 at UNESCO headquarters. The meeting immediately followed the open consultation session that was held on 28 February. Both meetings were held after the WSIS+10 review meeting, hosted by UNESCO, at the same location. The discussion took stock of the 7<sup>th</sup> IGF in Baku and worked to begin preparations for the 8<sup>th</sup> IGF, which is scheduled to be held in Bali, Indonesia from 22-25 October 2013.
2. Dr. Ashwin Sasongko, Director General of ICT Application, Ministry of CIT, Indonesia, served as chair of the meeting. Mr. Markus Kummer moderated the meeting as newly appointed interim chair of the open consultations and MAG meetings. Vyatcheslav Cherkasov represented the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) and Chengetai Masango represented the IGF Secretariat.
3. Many of the discussions from the open consultations fed directly into the deliberations of the MAG meeting. The meeting was open to observers who were also encouraged to participate in the meeting, and was made available in the form of live text streaming and via web-cast on the IGF website for online participation of MAG members who could not make it to Paris and to other interested stakeholders.
4. The Government of Indonesia gave a brief presentation regarding their preparatory process and provided some preliminary logistical information about the meeting to take place in Bali. Following the IGF tradition the meeting is being organized in a multi-stakeholder fashion, as representatives from all stakeholder groups are contributing to the planning.
5. The MAG discussed in some detail possible themes and sub-themes for the 2013 meeting. There was a suggestion to maintain the traditional main themes and it was noted that many of the themes could be classified as falling under the traditional themes. However, the general thrust of the discussions was in favour of trying out new formats and of moving away from the patterns used in previous years. It was felt that the main sessions had outlived their usefulness in their present form and the time had come to find new innovative ways of dealing with the substance under discussion. The 2013 IGF meeting should therefore be innovative and find new formats and headings for the main sessions.
6. Among the main themes proposed for the 2013 meeting there was strong support for the heading “Building Bridges”. Another theme that was supported by many was “Enhancing Multi-stakeholder cooperation for growth, development and human rights”. The suggestion was also made that the latter could be a sub-heading for the

first. A listing of many of the proposals is provided in the Annex.

7. Some conclusions emerged from the discussions on the format of the main sessions. While there was a general agreement that there was no “one size fits all format”, there was nevertheless a widely held view that a three-hour session was too long for most sessions and that it would be preferable to split them in half. There was also strong support that some of the main sessions could be held in the form of round-tables that would bring together the various thematic tracks of workshops. The MAG agreed to work towards integrating some new innovative formats into the traditional IGF meeting structure.
8. Some speakers also suggested clarifying with the UN interpretation services whether there was any flexibility in moving away from the traditional three- hour interpretation slots.
9. The discussions also took into account the suggestions from stakeholders received prior to the meeting from the open call by the Secretariat. A list of the proposals made over the course of the two days is attached at Annex. These proposals will guide the further substantive program planning together with new proposals made by stakeholders in the coming months through the call for workshop proposals.
10. There was much support in favour of keeping an introductory session for new participants as well as the traditional emerging issues and taking stock sessions. With regard to new sessions the following themes received much support:
  - Enhanced Cooperation
  - Human Rights / Freedom of Expression on the Internet
  - Internet Governance Principles
  - Legal Frameworks and Cyber-crime (Spam, Cyber-security, etc.)
  - Principles of Multi-stakeholder Cooperation
  - The Internet as an Engine for Growth and Advancement
11. There was a general understanding that there was a need to revise the procedure for the selection of workshops. It was felt that in the past there had been too many workshops without sufficient quality control. The MAG agreed that it would need to be more closely involved in selecting workshops and work more closely with organizers in all phases of workshop organization and implementation leading up to the annual meetings and should ensure quality control throughout the process.
12. The MAG assessed the criteria used previously for the selection of workshops, and agreed that there was a need to revise and adapt them to changing circumstances. It agreed to set up an open-ended working group to develop clear and easily understandable selection criteria. MAG Member Mervi Kultamaa agreed to take the lead of this group. The following were mentioned among the important criteria that would need to be maintained:
  - Bringing in “New Faces”
  - Clarity of format and expected outcome
  - Completeness and quality of proposals
  - Diversity of views

- a connection to Internet Governance per se
  - Inclusion of developing country voice(s)
13. The previously used workshop criteria were considered to continue to be desirable but not absolute and some of them should be applied more so on the macro level of the entire event rather than on a micro level, such as requirements to have geographic diversity and youth participation.
14. The MAG agreed to issue a preliminary call for workshop proposals, which should include a concise description of the thematic area of interest and other pertinent information. The proposals could focus on the priority themes identified by the open consultations/MAG meetings or could also introduce other themes. The deadline for submission of preliminary proposals will be **22 March 2013**. National and Regional IGF initiatives are also encouraged to submit such proposals.
15. The MAG will then assess and collate these initial proposals, asking proponents to further develop and complete them. It agreed to set **30 April 2013** as the final deadline for submitting complete workshop proposals.
16. There was some discussion regarding the distribution of materials at IGF annual meetings and the IGF Secretariat was requested to expand the guidelines already on the website to make clearer the expectations and process used for clearing materials for distribution. These guidelines are to be made public in advance of the May consultations.
17. The MAG also decided to set up additional online working groups to work on the following issues in the coming months in preparation of the 2013 IGF Meeting:
- Implementation of the CSTD Working Group Recommendations (Lead: Peter Major)
  - Internet Governance Principles (Lead: Anriette Esterhuysen)
  - Multistakeholder Principles and Enhanced Cooperation (Lead: Theresa Swineheart)

**18. Deadlines:**

22 March 2013: Submission of preliminary workshop proposals

30 April 2013: Submission of completed workshop proposals

## Annex

### Overall Title/Theme

- Building Bridges
- Enhancing Multi-stakeholder cooperation for growth, development and human rights.
- Freedom of Connection/ Freedom of Expression
- Internet Cooperation
- Multi-stakeholder Cooperation for growth, development and human rights, best practices for sustainable knowledge societies.
- Transforming Internet to Equinet

### **From the written submissions**

- “Internet governance for openness, sharing and improving the lives of all humanity”
- “Human rights and their implications for Internet governance”
- “Public interest principles for the Internet”
- “Shaping global principles for the Internet”
- “New service-oriented approach in the world based on the Internet of Services
- (IoS) and Internet of Things (IoT)”

### Main Sub Themes

- Science and Technology (In Internet) for Development
- Human Rights/Freedom of Expression  
(Security vs. Personal Rights and Freedoms)
- Internet Governance Principles/Multi-stakeholder Principles and Practices
- Enhanced Cooperation
- Internet as an Engine for Growth and Advancement  
(Multi-stakeholder Model. Local Content, Multi-Lingualism - Internet Ecosystem, Cooperation)
- Legal Frameworks and Crime
- (Spam, Cyber-security, etc.)
- Traditional IGF Main Themes

- Access & Diversity,
- Security, Openness & Privacy;
- Critical Internet Resources,
- Internet Governance for Development,
- Emerging Issues).
- Youth (Internet for kids, child safety, etc.)
- Internet Exchange Points
- Telecom/Internet Convergence/Conflict
- Public Access

#### **From the written submissions**

- “A focus on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and its implications for Internet Governance”
- “Child online protection”
- “Children's and young people's use of the internet”
- “Effective participation of all stakeholders in Internet governance”
- “Enhanced Cooperation”
- “Enhancing participation from developing countries in global Internet related for a”
- “Fostering multi-stakeholder governance mechanisms at national and regional levels”
- “Human Rights” (In Internet Governance)
- “Identifying and challenging increases in state censorship and control of the internet in a number of authoritarian and democratic states, and secondly debating the extent to which the role of large web hosts is resulting in a privatization of censorship whereby companies are making decisions and playing a role previously played by government, and with less accountability.”
- “Internet for Kids (the Innocent Minds & Next Generation)”
- “Internet for Kids”
- “Internet Rights and Principles”/ “Rights and Principles”/ “Public interest principles for the Internet”/ “Shaping global principles for the Internet.”
- “Multilingual content and applications”
- “Public Access”
- “Recent Trends/Highlights in Internet Governance”
- “Spam”
- “Trust in cyberspace”

### List of Participants

<b>Honorary Chair</b>	
<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Mr. Sastrosubroto, Sasongko Ashwin	Director General for ICT Application, Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (CIT), Republic of Indonesia

<b>Interim Chair</b>	
<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Mr. Kummer, Markus	Vice-President for Public Policy, ISOC

<b>MAG Members</b>	
<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Ms. Aguerre, Carolina	General Manager, Latin America and Caribbean TLD Association (LACTLD), Argentina
Mr. Aizu, Izumi	Senior Research Fellow and Professor, Institute for InfoSocioenomics, Tama University, Japan
Mr. Al Shatti, Qusai	Deputy Chairman, Kuwait Information Technology Society, Kuwait City
Ms. Bommelaer, Constance	Director, Public Policy, Internet Society (ISOC), Switzerland
Mr. Brueggeman, Jeff	Vice President - Public Policy and deputy Chief Privacy Officer, AT&T, USA
Mr. Carvell, Mark	Special Adviser and Executive Coordinator, Global Internet Governance Policy, Department for Culture, Media and Sport, UK Government
Ms. Cavalli, Olga del Carmen	Adviser for Technology, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Argentina
Mr. Dewapura, Reshan	Chief Executive Officer, ICT Agency of Sri Lanka
Mr. Disspain, Chris	Chief Executive Officer, AU Registry, Australia
Mr. Drake, William	International Fellow and Lecturer, Media Change and Innovation Division, IPMZ, University Zurich
Mr. Esmat, Baher	Manager - Regional Relations Middle East, Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN), Egypt
Ms. Esterhuysen, Anriette	Executive Director, Association for Progressive Communications (APC), South Africa
Ms. Fell, Lucinda	Director of Policy and Communication, Childnet, UK
Mr. Hajiyev, Nariman	Government of Azerbaijan
Ms. Hassan, Ayesha	Senior Policy Manager, Digital Economy, Executive in charge of ICT Policy, International Chamber of Commerce (ICC), France
Mr. Hilali, Abdelaziz	Professor, Institut Supérieur des Télécommunications de

	Rabat; President, Internet Society Morocco
Ms. Kelly, Sanja	Project Director, Freedom on the Net, Freedom House, USA
Ms. Kultamaa, Mervi	Counsellor, Department for External Economic Relations, Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland
Mr. Guo, Liang	Director of the China Internet Project and Associate Professor, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences (CASS), China
Mr. Major, Peter	Special Adviser, Permanent Mission of Hungary to the United Nations Office at Geneva
Mr. McCain, Cecil	Director of Post and Telecommunications, Office of the Prime Minister, Jamaica
Mr. Moedjiono, Sardjoeni	National ICT Council Executive Team Member, Indonesia
Ms. Morenets, Yuliya	Founder and Representative, TaC -Together against Cybercrime, France
Mr. Mustala, Tero	Principal Consultant, Nokia Siemens Networks, Finland
Ms. Nalwoga , Lillian	President, Internet Society Uganda/Collaboration on International IT Policy in East and Southern Africa
Ms. Neves Amoroso, Ana Cristina	Director of the Information Society Department at the Science and Technology Foundation, Ministry of Education and Science in Portugal
Mr. Netto , Franklin Silva	Government of Brazil
Ms. Nimpuno, Nurani	Outreach & Communications, Netnod/Autonomica
Ms. Okite, Judith	Internet Governance Coordinator, Free Software and Open Source Foundation for Africa Dynamic Coalitions on Disability and Accessibility, Kenya
Mr. Ostrowski, Igor	Undersecretary of State and Deputy of the Minister of Administration and Digitization, Ministry of Administration and Digitization, Poland
Mr. Pedraza-Barrios, Ricardo	Director Business Development - Global Public Policy and Government Relations, VeriSign Colombia SAS
Mr. Radunovic, Vladimir	Coordinator, Internet Governance Programmes, DiploFoundation, Serbia
Mr. Rendek, Paul	Director of External Relations, Réseaux IP Européens Network Coordination Centre (RIPE NCC), United Arab Emirates
Ms. Selaimen, Graciela	Executive Coordinator, Núcleo de Pesquisas, Estudos e Formação (NUPEF)
Ms. Seltzer, Wendy	Technical Team Privacy Identity policy, World Wide Web Consortium (W3C), USA
Mr. Spiller, Thomas	Vice President, Global Public Policy, Europe, Middle East and Africa, The Walt Disney Company, Belgium
Ms. Swinehart, Theresa	Executive Director, Global Internet Policy, Verizon Communications
Ms. Warren, Jennifer	Lockheed Martin
<b>MAG Members Participated Remotely</b>	
Ms. Cretu, Veronica	President, CMB Training Center
Mr. Olufuye, Jimson	CEO Kontemporary/ Vice-Chairman WITSA, Nigeria

Ms. Pandey, Tulika	Government of India
Mr. Wilson, Paul	Director General, Asia Pacific Network Information Centre (APNIC), Australia

### Intergovernmental Organizations and European Commission

Council of Europe	Mr. Hibbard, Lee
European Commission	Ms. Viceconte, Silvia
OECD	Ms. Weber, Verena
UNECA	Mr. Makane, Faye
UNESCO	Ms. Pollack, Rachel
UN - ESCWA	Mr. El Sherbiny, Ayman

### Indonesian Delegation

Name	Affiliation
Mr. Sastrosubroto, Sasongko Ashwin	Director General for ICT Application, Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (CIT), Republic of Indonesia
Mr. Harijadi, Djoko Agung	Secretary of Director General of ICT Application, Ministry of CIT, Republic of Indonesia
Mr. Pangerapan, Samuel	Indonesia Internet Provider Association
Ms. Rizki, Amelia	Legal and Cooperation Division, Secretariat Directorate General of ICT Application, Ministry of CIT, Republic of Indonesia
Mr. Sardjoeni, Moedjiono	National ICT Council Executive Team Member, Ministry of CIT, Republic of Indonesia
Ms. Laksmi, Shita	HIVOS

### Observers

#### Governments

Brazil	Embassador Benedicto Fonseca Filho
Canada	Mr. Charlton, Paul
China	Mr. Tang, Zicai
Switzerland	Mr. Schneider, Thomas
United States of America	Ms. Franz, Liesyl
United States of America	Mr. Duhns, Richard
United States of America	Ms. Gordon, Marian

#### Other Entities

Brazilian Internet Steering Committee	Mr. Glaser, Hartmut
CCIRDT	Mr. Gurstein, Michael
CENTR	Mr. Degezelle, Wim
Citizen Lab	Mr. Guerra, Robert
Dot Gay LLC	Ms. Doria, Avri



EBU	Mr. Mazzone, Giacomo
Glocom	Mr. Peake, Adam
ICC BASIS	Ms. Weise, Constance
ICT	Ms. Ndeye Maimouna Diop
IFLA	Mr. Beccalli, Andrea
IT for Change	Mr. Singh, Parminder
ITU	Mr. Gorges, Dupont
mCade	Ms. Cade, Marilyn
NUPEF	Mr. Carlos Afonso
PayPal	Mr. Smith, Bill
US Council for International Business	Ms. Wanner, Barbara
<b>Remote Participants</b>	
Mr. Ashton- Hart, Nick	
Ms. Deidre, Williams	
Mr. McCarthy, Kieren	
Ms. Paque, Virginia	
Mr. Poncelet, Ileleji	

<b>UNDESA</b>	
Mr. Cherkasov, Vyatcheslav	Senior Governance and Public Information Officer
<b>IGF Secretariat</b>	
Mr. Masango, Chengetai	Technology and Programme Manager
Ms. Badiei, Farzaneh	Consultant
Mr. Gutterman, Brian	Consultant