

**INTERNET GOVERNANCE FORUM
POLICY NETWORK ON MEANINGFUL ACCESS (PNMA)
MULTISTAKEHOLDER WORKING GROUP (MWG)**

- Virtual Meeting II | 22 July 2024 at 08:00 UTC -

SUMMARY REPORT

Action items and next steps

- **MWG composition/representation:** the co-chairs and Secretariat will reach out to MWG members who could not confirm their 2024 availability yet for this year's process. New joiners and replacing representatives will be contacted to provide their profile pic and designation, to be featured in the MWG page.
- **2024 process - timeline and work plan:** the timeline is approved; attendees are aware of its condensed period for deliberations. The work plan is approved, with observance to the discussion held around ways of working and operationalisation of the output report.
- **2024 process - ways of working:** attendees who engaged in the 2023 process have confirmed their willingness in engaging this year again. They highlighted that the coordination elements by the consultant were very helpful for peers' interaction and progress updates.
- **2024 process – operationalisation:** a few of the shared ideas involved exploring the host country's local practices for connectivity; engaging closely with the PNMA-related workshops so their outcomes can feed into the PNMA report and be shared widely; revisiting PNMA reports from earlier years to inform and update on the practices and conclusions from back then (what is their status? have they proven true? have good practices kept their promise? etc)
- The PNMA is continuously open to welcoming good practices on meaningful access. Please share them via email and/or during the monthly meetings. We are preparing a permanent link on the PNMA web page for such submissions too
- Next call: end of August, between 21 - 26, observing the time zone rotation (this time: ET). After confirming the co-chairs' agendas, the community will vote on preferred dates via a doodle form (tbc by early August).

1. The second meeting of the Internet Governance Forum (IGF) Policy Network on Meaningful Access (PNMA) Multistakeholder Working Group (MWG) was hosted online on 22 July 2024 at 08:00 UTC. The meeting's purpose was to confirm the acceptance of the 2024 work plan and timeline, in addition to discussing the composition of internal working groups, based on PNMA's focus areas (Connectivity/Digital Inclusion/Capacity Development).
2. The meeting was hosted by the IGF Secretariat with Ms. Daphnee Iglesias, Consultant PNMA as report support, and co-chaired by Mr. Giacomo Mazzone and Hon. Alhagie Mbow. The

final, adopted version of the Agenda is attached to this document as Annex A1 and a list of meeting participants as Annex A2. The list of input documents is annexed as A3.

3. The meeting was opened by the Secretariat's reminder that the PNMA is approved by the MAG as one of the modalities of the IGF 2024 intersessional work, following the incremental work of past years and underlying the topic of access is deeply anchored in the [thematic framework of the IGF 2024](#).

Introduction / Welcome message from the co-chairs

4. The meeting started with an introduction by the Secretariat followed by a tour de table in the chat box, prompted by first-time attendees. The Secretariat presented the agenda and clarified that all IGF online meetings are now recorded by standard practice and will be made available after each call. It is fine for participants to not display their video and/or voice, interacting from the chat only, if one feels uncomfortable with the recording.

2024 MWG Composition/Renewal: welcoming new members

5. Giacomo Mazzone clarifies that the PNMA is composed of a core group – the MWG – in which it is mostly an organisation representation. It is important to know who from the current members will remain active this year, and who would be new joiners. Equally important is to confirm whether partner organisations will keep the same focal points that have been dealing with the PN requests for the last years. He asks for members attending the meeting to confirm interest in permanently joining the network activities until December. It is registered that Mr. Bertrand Moullier, Mr. Roberto Zambrana, Ms. Maria de Brasdefer, Mr. Maarten Botterman, Mr. Poncelet Ileleji, Mr. Roberto Gaetano, Ms. Sonia Jorge, and Ms. Margaret Nyambura Ndung'u actively confirm interest. UNESCO will send a new representative, since Ms. Marielza Oliveira left her position; GSMA will also send new focal points. IEEE and UNHCR are new joiners, sending representatives from the next meeting onwards. The DCAD will be represented by Ms. Judith Hellerstein.
6. Giacomo Mazzone opens the floor for other participants who have not yet been called to express themselves, on the contribution one can give to the working group. The co-chair takes note of Mr. Lucien Castex's availability, and that he is indirectly involved in the Gigabit project of the European Commission. Mr. Poncelet Ileleji (Gambia IGF) reinforces his willingness to support meaningful connectivity work in the African continent and to contribute to any write-ups. He currently has projects with the Association for Progressive Communication – APC – and also sits on its Board. Ms. Jasmine Ko represents .Asia and shares the organisation's interest and availability in exploring meaningful connectivity alongside the PNMA in Asia. Mr. Nicolas Fiumarelli (Uruguay IGF) shares it is important to showcase national and regional initiatives and focus on these communities, including multilingual issues about the access to high quality Internet – this has been done for several years in the IGF. Universal acceptance is another vital factor for meaningful access, as shown by the UNESCO indicators. About the Latin American and Caribbean perspectives or

needs, these communities include meaningful access in education, employment, and skills development – not forgetting Internet standards safety and security. For 2024, he is interested in capacity development tools/projects one can organise as he believes the topic should be promoted more at the IGF. Giacomo Mazzone acknowledges the importance of said perspective and would like to consider Nicolas Fiumarelli as liaison with the NRIs on said topic.

7. Mr. Nazar Nicholas (Tanzania IGF) asks for the floor to thank for the votes on his community network project which won the 2024 WSIS Prize in the area of access to information and knowledge. The Tanzania Digital Inclusion Project, created to build 20 to 200 community networks around the country, has already connected 25 schools, five public markets, police stations, and health centers. Local governments appear mostly as partners providing spaces for the network infrastructure, and the Tanzania Scouts work along young people sharing the idea. These Tanzanian cases can be presented as success examples during the PNMA discussions; Nazar Nicholas is available to share any skills and knowledge that emerged from the working with local communities. The seeding initiative is promoted by ISOC. He would like to contribute to the connectivity and digital inclusion areas.
8. Giacomo Mazzone acknowledges the importance of the project and that it could federate more stakeholders into similar situations. As final statement regarding the MWG composition, the co-chairs and the Secretariat will confirm with absentees their participation or withdrawal from the 2024 process, in order to have a new updated list of MWG members if possible by the next meeting.

2nd Open Consultation and MAG meeting

9. Both co-chairs attended the event in person, held in Geneva between 26-28 June 2024. Hon. Alhagie Mbow explained the IGF annual meeting theme and subthemes are defined, with the PNMA falling under Subtheme 3 - Advancing human rights and inclusion in the digital age. The main sessions are currently being developed with assistance of MAG members allocated in subteams (at this moment it is not open to external participation). In the next few weeks confirmations on discussion topic and speakers for the connecting session with the PNMA will be possible.
10. Hon. Alhagie Mbow clarifies the list of selected workshops is finalised. Certain criteria were closely observed: alignment with IGF, diversity of speakers, diversity of organisers, what kind of questions are organisers trying to get answers to.
11. Daphnee Iglesias explains the list of selected workshops is published on the IGF website.

Workplan and Timeline

12. Giacomo Mazzone starts the discussion on the updated workplan and timeline, sent to the PNMA community for appreciation. He opens the floor for any suggestion or improvement the attendees want to raise attention to. If no objections are made, the PNMA considers the documents as approved.
13. As a refresher, Daphnee Iglesias shares the slides of the PNMA main goals for the current year: she explains the PNMA has incremental goals since its inception. For the 2024 process, the goal is to assist and advocate for the policy solutions that we found out that are replicable and are also successful to raise and to tackle the key issues that was raised last year. Giacomo Mazzone highlights that the timeline is provided by the IGF Secretariat and the PNMA has to respect its deadlines, working well and organised to implement all activities culminating in the output report.

Composition of internal working groups, based on PNMA's focus areas

14. Before defining how to operate, Giacomo Mazzone clarifies it is important to have a look in the documents already produced and available in the PNMA webpage. Specially for those who were not with us last year, there one finds most of the reflection that we have done, and that will be used now as a baseline for the work we have to do this year. As in 2023, each focus area holds a working group with a coordinated/focal point for easy communication with the co-chairs and the Secretariat. From those who participated in the last process, Giacomo Mazzone asks for feedback and suggestions on how to improve the experience.
15. Roberto Zambrana acknowledges the method has been good and that the work is specially assisted by Daphnee Iglesias' fantastic job. He believes the analyses of previous experiences identified in 2023 should go on, expanding it to the previous years of PNMA's operation too (i.e., since 2021's collations). It would be interesting to have some sort of research on how projects evolved after a few years. His suggestion is corroborated by other attendees via messages in the chat. Roberto Zambrana states he would like to work on the capacity building and connectivity areas.
16. Ms. Margaret Nyambura Ndung'u agrees discussing good practices over the last three years and how they can be replicated has been a good method. The organisation and logistical processes, with Daphnee Iglesias' help, are equally approved. As suggestion, she would like to see specific policy recommendations, contextualised with what has been done and what has worked in each focus areas ("from the time the first cases reached us, what has changed?"). Margaret Nyambura Ndung'u reiterates she is happy to continue support digital inclusion and capacity building works.
17. Giacomo Mazzone confirms with Daphnee Iglesias that the previous work structure is good and that slight changes can be implemented. The report is not set in stone, and can adapt itself to how the community develops its ideas. Roberto Zambrana adds that he supports

Ndung'u's position on the PNMA priorities and adds that the inputs provided to the Global Digital Compact and their outcomes should be made available to the general audience. With said additional slight change, it is then considered that the PNMA agrees on the work structure and timeline for 2024.

18. Mutegeki Cliff Agaba expresses his interest in assisting with digital inclusion and connectivity areas. Currently, he is working with community networks in Uganda and is part of the Uganda IGF Organising Committee, as well as for Youth IGF and East African IGF.
19. Maarten Botterman expresses his support to the PNMA activities, with emphasis on connectivity and multilingualism. He advocates as a priority to bring in leading industries to the discussion, e.g., as their ESG activities; he also draws attention to the role of UNESCO in the works around multilingualism.
20. Nicolas Fiumarelli seconds Botterman's comment on industry participation and multilingualism – specifically on, e.g., internationalised email addresses, universal domain names, IPV6 deployment for better quality of service and meaningful access. He also complements Roberto Zambrana's comment on capacity development, on the importance of alignment and inclusion of more actors in said aspect. Community network workshops, for instance, are examples of new courses that society needs to be prepared for. It is also important to have feedback from said courses and how people have started to use this knowledge.
21. Bertrand Moullier asks for the floor and shares that at his organisation – the International Federation of Film Producers Associations – the interest in the PNMA process is high because they have seen that, on the ground, it is content that drives demand for connectivity. This can only be meaningful and complete if people have access to it in a cultural and social relevant matter, as well as being linguistically relevant. As an industry representative, they observe that all over the world, and especially in LDCS and developing countries, the issue of sustainability, of creating meaningful local content in the languages that literally speak to people, remains a very acute one. They believe that audio visual content on the Internet have to be approached in an ecosystemic way and co-regulated together, not forgetting to find strategies to empower and generate economically sustainable local content production. Speaking of this year's focus areas, Bertrand Moullier believes their work now cut across both the digital inclusion agenda, which again speaks in particular to multilingualism, and the capacity building efforts (both in a narrow sense of networks and systems, but also in the ability to have sustainable content production at the birthplaces of said cultures and communities). They would like to bring colleagues from India to the PNMA process as a font of interesting case studies and best practices.

Initial discussion on experiences to be featured in the PNMA Plenary Session in Riyadh

22. Giacomo Mazzone acknowledges all contributions and takes notes to come back to the discussion of case studies when the plenary in Riyadh will be discussed. As there are no

more raised hands, Hon Alhagie Mbow takes the floor to speak about the IGF main sessions as these are the most structured ones and deal with particular issues. The session related to the PNMA process is the session on “advancing human rights and inclusion in the digital age”; Hon Alhagie Mbow is part of the organising committee and can represent PNMA’s specific needs and viewpoints there. For the moment, only MAG members can join the mentioned committees; according to him, maybe in the next month or so other actors might be able to join. Besides shaping the PNMA plenary with interesting cases from the Arab region, it will be interesting to be in the place where similar initiatives are being discussed (e.g., the main session and workshops). Giacomo Mazzone states the policy network has not been able to do it thoroughly in the past years, with the exception of our presence in the 2023’s NRIs session. Seconding Hon Alhagie Mbow’s comment, Mazzone clarifies the parliamentary track would be the place where these cases can be brought to the attention of people that can eventually follow up in international and regional parliamentary assemblies.

23. Nicolas Fiumarelli suggests the implementation of a collaborative feedback spreadsheet, so PNMA members can provide rapid info from related sessions, in order to include this dates in the main report or to touch upon it in the plenary. This would be helpful not to lose incremental crucial information on this year’s process as well as the local Saudi reflections. Giacomo Mazzone agrees with the suggestion and its relevance.
24. Lucien Castex (AFNIC, France) clarifies they will be following the inclusion track and human rights too; his connection dropped so it was impossible to get more details.
25. Going back to the PNMA plenary session, Giacomo Mazzone shares there are two ideas for this moment in 2024: the presentation of relevant examples on meaningful access in the Arab regions, and the recent EU approval of the [Gigabit Infrastructure Act](#). For the first, Mazzone asks everybody in the group to find the relevant contributions that will be important to the host country – and also, of course, other relevant examples coming from the rest of the world. On the latter, it would be good to explore how the EU will prepare and finance the structure to take meaningful connectivity to regions that are not sustainable in market terms. It would be interesting to have someone from the EU working on this so we can discuss all questions a project like this one raises.
26. Maarten Botterman complements he would like to draw attention to the European Commission’s Declaration of Digital Rights and Principles. On the Saudi examples, he suggests finding counterparts in the region. Roberto Gaetano will contact his academic partners there. On the national institutions, Giacomo Mazzone states the PNMA probably needs to rely on the Secretariat as intermediary because they hold better, more direct relations with them.

AOB & Next steps

27. The registration for this year’s meeting is already open; online and onsite attendance need to be registered [here](#).
 28. The next PNMA meeting will happen at the end of August – preferred days are between 21 and 26. A doodle poll to select the best time (according to ET) will be sent in a few days. The agenda of the next call should focus on, amongst other topics:
 - Development of the work plan with the internal working groups
 - Setup of the PNMA Plenary in Riyadh
-

ANNEX A1

Agenda

1. Introduction/Tour de table
2. Confirmed Work Plan and Timeline
3. 2024 MWG Composition/Renewal: welcoming new members
4. Composition of internal working groups, based on PNMA's focus areas (Connectivity / Digital Inclusion / Capacity Development)
5. Initial discussion on experiences to be featured in the PNMA Plenary Session in Riyadh
6. AoB & Next Steps

ANNEX A2

Attendance List

	NAME	ORGANISATION
1.	Bertrand Moullier	FIAPF
2.	Daphnee Iglesias	Consultant, IGF Secretariat
3.	Giacomo Mazzone	RAI
4.	Hon. Alhagie Mbow	Gambia National Parliament, Pan African Parliament
5.	Jasmine Ko	.Asia
6.	Lucien Castex	AFNIC
7.	Maarten Botterman	GNKS Consult
8.	Margaret Nyambura Ndung'u	GDIP
9.	Maria de Brasdefer	IFLA
10.	Mutegeki Cliff Agaba	Uganda IGF
11.	Nicholas Nazar	Tanzania IGF
12.	Nicolas Fiumarelli	Uruguay IGF
13.	Poncelet Ileleji	Gambia IGF
14.	Roberto Gaetano	Independent
15.	Roberto Zambrana	Former MAG Member, Bolivia IGF

ANNEX A3

Input documents

- 2024 IGF Themes
<https://intgovforum.org/en/content/igf-2024-themes>
- PNMA members of multistakeholder working group
<https://www.intgovforum.org/en/content/pnma-multistakeholder-working-group-0>
- PNMA Repository of Good Practices
<https://intgovforum.org/en/content/pnma-repository>
- 2024 PNMA Meeting II – Slides
https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot_download/256/27915