INTERNET GOVERNANCE FORUM
POLICY NETWORK ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE
MULTISTAKEHOLDER WORKING GROUP
Meeting V | 12 September 2024 at 12:00-13:15 UTC

SUMMARY REPORT

Action items:

- Sub-groups will finalize draft Discussion Papers by 1.10.

- Everyone will share speaker ideas for PNAI's session at IGF 2024 Annual meeting by 10.10.

- Written feedback to UNESCO Consultation paper on AI regulation is welcome through UNESCO website until 19.9.

- The next PNAI MWG calls will take place on 10.10. and 22.10. Registration will open shortly.

- The remaining PNAI MWG 2024 calls are planned for 21.11. and 6.12.

---

1. The fifth online meeting in 2024 of the Policy Network on Artificial Intelligence (PNAI) Multistakeholder Working Group (MWG) took place on 12 September 2024 at 12:00 UTC.

2. The meeting was hosted by the MAG appointed facilitator of the PNAI and the IGF Secretariat's PNAI Consultant. The final version of the Agenda is attached to this document as Annex A1 and a list of meeting participants as Annex A2. The list of shared documents is annexed as A3.

3. The hosts opened the meeting and explained the agenda. The first goal for the meeting was to give feedback to UNESCO Consultation paper on AI regulation that has been developed in cooperation with the Inter-Parliamentary Union and the IGF's Parliamentary track. Another main item are the final progress updates from the four PNAI Sub-groups.

4. Prateek Sibal and Mei Jie Chen from UNESCO presented highlights of the Consultation paper. The paper was shared to attendees in advance and is attached to this Summary Report.

    o   Nine approaches to regulating AI were identified, ranging from principles-based approach to assigning liability to problematic AI uses. Most regulations combine approaches. There is significant progress in regulating AI: between 2016-2023, 32 countries passed laws mentioning AI.

    o   Meeting attendees were active in giving feedback through an interactive tool as well as direct questions and comments to the presenters. Suggestions included for example: adding scenarios and to help identify suitable approach for different jurisdictions; the global cooperation between approaches, and, importance of capacity building for policymakers.

o Further feedback is welcome through UNESCO website until 19.9. and Yik Chan is collecting PNAI's written feedback through GoogleDocs.

5. Tuesday **1.10.** is deadline for draft versions of the Discussion Papers.

   o Draft Discussion Papers will be debated in the next two PNAI MWG meetings: Thursday **10.10.** and Tuesday **22.10.** Two topics per call. Attendees will give feedback, comment and ask questions. Draft Discussion Papers will be circulated latest seven days before the calls.

   o The drafting teams will edit their papers based on the feedback. Friday **25.10.** is the deadline for final versions of the Discussion Papers.

   o There is no official page limit, length is under the Sub-groups' consideration. 14 pages is the recommended maximum, the shorter the better.

6. Sub-groups are in the final stages of drafting:

   o **Environmental Sustainability and the Generative AI value chain**. The Sub-group is confident their final draft Discussion paper will be ready in time. Suggestions on case studies on generative AI and environment (especially from Latin America, Caribbean) are still welcome. The team will share a consolidated draft for feedback and inputs on 12.9.

   o **AI governance, Interoperability, and Good practices**. Review of existing policy work is mostly finished; current focus is analysing interoperability of AI regulatory frameworks. Input and feedback are needed especially on ethical interoperability and technical interoperability. There is 40+ pages of text, the Sub-group was encouraged to start shortening and editing the material now.

   o **Liability as a mechanism for ensuring AI accountability**. The Sub-group has many new contributors since the last update. Still new, especially legal, expertise is welcome. The Discussion Paper will highlight the need for AI liability conversation and identify key principles where more discussion and consensus is needed. Including liability as one of the key policy levers in the UNESCO Consultation paper is appreciated.

   o **Labour issues within AI's life cycle**. The Sub-group has held regular calls in the past weeks and made progress. Team leaders were not present in the meeting to give update and are encouraged to share any requests for support through PNAI mailing list.

   o Sub-group meeting dates and latest drafts are available on PNAI Sub-groups page (https://intgovforum.org/en/content/pnai-sub-groups).

7. Facilitators thanked UNESCO for the presentation and dialogue.

8. PNAI Sub-group leaders and members were thanked for the good progress and leading the discussions so far. Team leaders are encouraged to contact PNAI Facilitators and the community through PNAI mailing list for any support needed in the final drafting weeks.

Other and next steps

9. Maikki will create a draft concept note for PNAI session at IGF 2024 Annual Meeting (in meeting materials). Everyone is welcome to add suggestions for speakers and comments.

10. Next Sub-group meetings are:

    o AI & Labour: Friday **13.9.** and Friday **20.9.**

    o AI & Environment: Tuesday **24.9.**

    o AI & Liability: Wednesday **18.9.**

    o AI Governance Sub-group meeting is planned for next week

11. Next MWG meetings will take place on Thursday **10.10** and Tuesday **22.10.**

12. A meeting summary, materials and presentations will be shared through the PNAI mailing list.

13. Please share your questions and suggestions with Maikki Sipinen (maikki.sipinen@un.org).

<div align="center">***</div>

ANNEX A1
AGENDA, PNAI Multistakeholder Working Group Meeting IV

1. <u>Opening</u>

    Opening the call and updates on latest developments
    – Audace Niyonkuru and Amrita Choudhury, PNAI Facilitators

2. <u>UNESCO consultation paper on AI regulation</u>

    UNESCO will present a consultation paper on regulatory approaches for AI that has been developed in cooperation with the Inter-Parliamentary Union and the IGF's Parliamentary track. Attendees are encouraged to read the paper in advance and give feedback.
    Presentation
    – Prateek Sibal, Programme Specialist, UNESCO

    Discussion, feedback and questions

3. <u>PNAI Sub-groups</u>

    Updates by Sub-group team leaders:

    AI Governance, interoperability and good practices
    – Yik Chan Chin, Sergio Mayo, Amado Espinosa and Chafic Chaya

    Environmental sustainability within AI value chain
    – Shamira Ahmed and Mohd Asyraf Zulkifley

Labor issues throughout AI's life cycle
– Germán López and Olga Cavalli

Liability as a mechanism for ensuring AI accountability
– Caroline Friedman Levy and Umut Pajaro Velasquez

4. Next steps
5. Closing and any other business

ANNEX A2
MEETING PARTICIPANTS (in alphabetical order[1]):

1. Hisham Aboulyazeed
2. Shamira Ahmed
3. Muriel Alapini
4. María Arzamendia
5. Adoley Azu
6. Celine Bal
7. Patrick Bell
8. Sofia Bourhim
9. Titti Cassa
10. Yik Chan Chin
11. Chafic Chaya
12. Mei Jie Chen
13. Amrita Choudhury
14. Maria Corazon Caritativo
15. Jin Cui
16. Dooshima Dapo-Oyewole
17. Mohamed Mehdi Dib
18. Aji Fama Jobe
19. Pedro Franco
20. Caroline Friedman Levy
21. Sumair Gul
22. Judith Hellerstein
23. Poncelet Ileleji
24. Luqman Ahmad Khan
25. Jasmine Ko
26. Maksat Korooluev
27. Kenji Kuramochi
28. Ramyaa M
29. Sivasubramanian M

---

[1] Names indicated as participants identified in the Zoom online participation tool

30. Raymond Mamattah
31. Barbara Marchiori de Assis
32. Susan Mohr
33. Yahya Morattab
34. Wanda Muñoz
35. Sivasubramanian Muthusamy
36. Audace Niyonkuru
37. Rose Ofianga
38. A Oni
39. June Parris
40. Heramb Podar
41. Andrea Raab-Gray
42. Andy Richardson
43. Claudia Rida
44. Mariana Rozo Paz
45. Ayobangira Safari
46. Azeem Sajjad
47. Shinji Sato
48. Gaurav Sharma
49. Prateek Sibal
50. Maikki Sipinen
51. Cerys Stansfield
52. Lufuno T Tshikalange
53. Barbara Weisel
54. Mohd Asyraf Zulkifley

ANNEX A3
SHARED DOCUMENTS

Presentations

> Meeting presentation
> https://intgovforum.org/en/filedepot_download/282/28143
>
> UNESCO presentation
> https://intgovforum.org/en/filedepot_download/282/28144

Concept note: PNAI session for IGF 2024 Annual Meeting

> https://docs.google.com/document/d/1y9OvtO7mm3sR6-
> 6eV4pUFVELfYeEEWu6zM7cQJalwJY/edit?pli=1

Material on UNESCO Consultation paper on AI regulation

UNESCO Consultation paper on AI regulation
https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000390979

Background information on UNESCO consultation
https://www.unesco.org/en/articles/unesco-launches-open-consultation-inform-ai-governance

PNAI Feedback on UNESCO consultation
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1G0V_xO8UWIps30eVzanRl5wx59mqdlpkk2so7R7lub4/edit

Latest Materials shared by PNAI Sub-groups

Sub-group 'AI governance, Interoperability, and Good practices'
Latest draft Discussion Paper:
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Ob8tRub7DzGevLvaJUjhk9biheTfYaQ1YBSaSXsxp_A/edit

Sub-group 'Labour issues within AI's life cycle'
Latest draft Discussion Paper:
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1IA0aqHOzkT8qJZEEaEGSulXVXOJ1Vhb4axv4QJv-Xe4/edit?usp=sharing

Sub-group 'Environmental sustainability within Generative AI value chain'
Latest draft Discussion Paper:
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1FbA-e-7rurdkJRBC1GuQOrDkIBPcNEkVqMWWUi8exJo/edit?usp=sharing

Sub-group 'Liability as a mechanism for ensuring AI accountability'
Latest draft Discussion Paper:
https://docs.google.com/document/d/11IW4-OerHsZTBoQQ5b3Od61wP8jLxPiaKD-geytuj6c/edit