

**INTERNET GOVERNANCE FORUM
POLICY NETWORK ON MEANINGFUL ACCESS (PNMA)
MULTISTAKEHOLDER WORKING GROUP (MWG)
- Virtual Meeting I | 11 June 2024 at 11:00 UTC -**

SUMMARY REPORT

Action items and next steps

- The PNMA co-chairs will modify the final version of the 2024 work plan, based on the discussion held today
- The [MWG composition](#) will be confirmed by the next meeting; please get in touch if you would like to make a referral or let us know if you do not want to be part of it anymore
- The working documents and meeting details will be uploaded to the PNMA webpage
- Next call: 22 July at 8:00 AM UTC¹

1. The first meeting of the Internet Governance Forum (IGF) Policy Network on Meaningful Access (PNMA) Multistakeholder Working Group (MWG) was hosted online on 11 June 2024 at 11:00 UTC. The meeting's purpose was to discuss the objectives of PNMA in 2024.
2. The meeting was hosted by the IGF Secretariat with Ms. Daphnee Iglesias, Consultant PNMA as report support, and co-chaired by Mr. Giacomo Mazzone and Hon. Alhagie Mbow. The final, adopted version of the Agenda is attached to this document as Annex A1 and a list of meeting participants as Annex A2. The list of input documents is annexed as A3.
3. The meeting was opened by the Secretariat's reminder that the PNMA is approved by the MAG as one of the modalities of the IGF 2024 intersessional work, following the incremental work of past years and underlying the topic of access is deeply anchored in the [thematic framework of the IGF 2024](#).

Introduction / Welcome message from the co-chairs

4. The meeting started with an introduction of this year's co-chairs followed by a tour de table with the participants. The Secretariat presented the agenda and clarified that all IGF online meetings are now recorded by standard and will be made available after each call. It is fine

¹ The final date was fixed and announced after the call, during the 2nd MAG Meeting held on 28 June in Geneva, at the UN HQ.

for participants to not display their video and/or voice, interacting from the chat only, if one feels uncomfortable with the recording.

2024 MWG Composition/Renewal

5. Giacomo Mazzone clarifies that the PNMA is composed of a core group – the MWG – in which it is mostly an organisation representation (a sort of network of networks). There is the wider PNMA community as well, where everybody could participate. All contributions will be treated equally. To start the topic discussion, he asks for the participants to assume all present are interested in permanently joining the network activities until December. It is registered that Ms. Elizabeth Orembo and Ms. Margaret Nyambura Ndung'u actively confirm interest as expressed during the session.
6. IGF Secretariat explains how the PNMA process works and which outputs are expected by the end of year, in conjunction with the 2024 IGF Subthemes. The network was conceived as incremental, hence the focus areas – connectivity, digital inclusion and capacity development – and the collation of good practices around meaningful access will go on for this year. With defined methodology questions, updates on previous cases from the Repository will also be tackled. In the end, the network will know what are the key actions that need to be addressed, given the fact we all know there are many policy practices already in place, yet with loopholes – the observance will allow the network to verify whether the problems are in regionalisation, scaling, partnerships etc.
7. The MWG is the PNMA pool of partners that they have been representing the main focus points for each of these focal areas throughout the year while we do our work. It is a permanent bridge between the PNMA and institutions or local groups. It is a space not to just investigate what is happening around meaningful access, but also how to present and actively exchange solutions to policy implementation problems. The co-chairs would welcome referrals from the participants and will actively look for new potential members, as a new MWG will be presented in July.

2023 Achievements and 2024 Process

8. The Secretariat shares that the 2023 outputs will be the base for the work in 2024: the cases added to the [Repository of Good Practices](#), coupled with the listed recommendations and key issues around meaningful access that were raised throughout 2023.
9. The main goal for the 2024 process is to assist and advocate for the implementation of policy solutions from these previously raised key issues, along with the ongoing experiences that were collected in the repository. The 2024 output report will hold recommendations as per last year, but also additional ones that fit into the IGF Messages and other similar processes.

10. The Secretariat and co-chairs are analysing the possibility of opening a few PNMA sessions for a public debate or permanent dialogue with experts in the focus areas. The proposal is open to suggestions from the community as it is also dependant on the process timeline.

Priorities and Activities Timeline

11. The draft report to be presented at the Plenary Session in Riyadh is to be ready by 10 December. After the Annual Meeting is over there is time to polish it up and deliver the final document by 31 December.
12. The timeline is provided by the IGF Secretariat and the PNMA will work around it to meet the milestones. As per other processes, it is suggested that meetings will take place monthly, with the option of fortnightly calls when necessary. Participants praise that discussions will be scheduled in alternated time zones, allowing more members from different continents to join the discussions. Meetings will follow the order CET – JPT/Asia – ET.
13. Mr. Samuel Jose suggests other Asian time zones to be considered: between UTC + 5.30 - UTC + 8, but for the moment was decided to start with these three times zones and eventually modify it in the course of the process.
14. Starting from meeting 3 in August, a doodle pool will be launched at least 10 days before the call, for community assessment of the most adequate meeting times. Despite the different timetables, the PNMA takes into account the dates for other big events, as the COP and ICANN meetings, before setting up its own.
15. Monthly calls will happen mainly to develop the outputs planned in the PNMA work plan (including its main report). It will also include: identifying networking opportunities between the PN, IGF and other institutions; receive input from our members about their participation in events/workshop in and out of IGF, in settings where the PNMA can be introduced. The Plenary Session will be equally planned within our meetings, along with the hybrid or onsite participation of PNMA colleagues during 2024 IGF. Each action item is listed in detail in the full timeline.
16. Giacomo Mazzone brings attention to the tight timeline; to achieve results and have an impact on the IGF Debate in due time, it is important to deliver most of what we can before the Annual Meeting. The PNMA Plenary Session can be the place to observe a first impact of this draft report and gauge reaction of other qualified partners, from whom additional ideas can be included in the manuscript before final delivery.
17. The 2024 PNMA process has 3 main priorities: bring activities and solutions to bigger spaces where said ideas can flourish and create meaningful contributions; boost advocacy and relationships with local, regional and intergovernmental partnerships; act by amplifying the voices of those groups that are least heard. Attention to AI is not forgotten, as for instance, how it can make the digital divide better or worse, and how could improve the access experience for groups traditionally marginalized.

18. Previous partnerships with the IGF Secretariat and the Leadership Panel, other intersessional activities, and international organisations were successful and will be expanded in 2024.
19. Hon. Alhagie Mbow highlights that it is crucial to have everyone on board, and makes special mention to on developing capacity of parliamentarians, so they understand why meaningful connectivity is important and how much it can cost. By creating a relationship with them, they will be able to handle the policies and budget approvals/allocations in their respective countries or at African Union level. Hon. Alhagie Mbow shares he is the co-founder and vice-chair of the African Parliamentary Network on Internet Governance, with nearly 30 members from over 25 countries. They have been working with ICANN and IGF to implement capacity development actions with the lawmakers. Possible interactions of PNMA with these communities will be explored during this year.

Output report structure

20. The output report will follow a similar structure of the 2023 report, with adaptations for the new methodology questions that 2023 key issues might require. Discussions will be presented following the three focus areas, each one constituting a small working group of voluntary adhesions. Daphnee Iglesias will provide secretarial support and umbrella coordination for all report sections, following what is determined by the co-chairs.
21. There are two new report items for 2024: a section on most relevant literature in meaningful access, and another section with references to meaningful access in the draft document about The Future of the Internet and of the Digital World.
22. The full structure of the output report is included in the [slides deck](#) which supports this discussion.

Discussion / Q&A

23. Samuel Jose asks about the next steps until the July meeting and whether there is anything already planned for the PNMA to work on the road to the Global Digital Compact adoption in the Summit of the Future. Giacomo Mazzone explains that the first main point of action between now and July is the confirmation of the MWG composition, so the PNMA knows which institutions are committed to engaging with this year's process until the end. Another task is resuming the collection of best practices, also with a proactive approach by the PN. Hon. Alhagie Mbow clarifies that so far there has been no official position shared for the Summit of the Future, but more consultations will be made, including with Mr. Chengetai Masango. Giacomo adds that the concept of meaningful access did not appear in the first draft. A PNMA contribution was sent asking for the introduction of the term in the draft and some other contributions also raised the same concern. Luckily, the term is now added to the current draft, although it is not too much explained what is intended for "meaningful". It is

necessary to push for more integration and association of the concept to the need of having policies that could incentivize local languages, local contents, local services that could make connectivity “meaningful”, and to have best practices that could be replicated.

24. Mr. Wai Min Kwok adds to the earlier point that a GDC revision has been shared around a month ago, still under discussion among the member-states. There are a few points that will be subject of further negotiation, especially on AI, but issues like capacity building is one item that have not been lost – member-states and stakeholders agree on it. Hence, there is a good strategy for this group to think about how to look into the implementation of the GDC. A revision could be shared in a few days². It is not certain whether the negotiations would be concluded in June or July. It seems it may take more time, but the aim is still to definitely adopt it in September, at the Summit of The Future.
25. Regarding involvement with international organisations, Wai Min Kwok will reach out to his UNDP colleagues in New York inviting them to join the PNMA; they have interests in joining. He will present the bigger group meetings but if needed a one-to-one briefing might be best. Giacomo Mazzone acknowledges the referral and adds that it would be interesting to have someone from DESA in the meetings, as e-government could become one of meaningful access’ pillars. Wai Min Kwok clarifies this is the subject he is currently involved with (The e-government Survey) and it is also of interest to IGF’s host Saudi Arabia. This is a good connection as they would like to showcase what they have done and IGF can be a platform for that.

Next steps

26. The next PNMA meeting will happen on 22 July and we shall start the time-zone rotation with the Central European time, followed by Asia Pacific time. The agenda of the next call should focus on:
- Confirmation of outgoing members of the MWG and collection of new proposal for 2024
 - Publication of the final version of the 2024 work plan
 - Establishing focus area working groups around the three pillars of the report:
 - Connectivity
 - Digital Inclusion
 - Capacity Development
 - Initial thoughts about which experience to invite to the plenary session in Riyadh

² GDC document, 2nd Review: [GlobalDigitalCompact_rev2.pdf \(un.org\)](#). The concept of “meaningful connectivity” appears in various sentences within page 3.

ANNEX A1

Agenda

1. Introduction/Welcome message PNMA Co-Chairs
2. 2024 MWG Composition/Renewal
3. 2023 Achievements
4. 2024 process: proposal and priorities
5. Activities Timeline - IGF Secretariat deadlines and PNMA meetings (draft)
6. Output report structure
7. Discussion / Q&A
8. Next steps and AoB

ANNEX A2

Attendance List

	NAME	ORGANISATION
1.	Anja Gengo	IGF Secretariat
2.	Anne Shannon Baxter	GSMA
3.	Daphnee Iglesias	Consultant, IGF Secretariat
4.	Elizabeth Orembo	Research ICT Africa
5.	Eyob Esatu	ISD Africa
6.	Giacomo Mazzone	RAI
7.	Hon. Alhagie Mbow	Gambia National Parliament, Pan African Parliament
8.	Hon. Ayobangira Safari	Democratic Republic of Congo Parliament
9.	Judith Hellerstein	IGF DC Accessibility and Disability
10.	Marco Paloski	Scopia, Youth Coalition of Internet Governance
11.	Margaret Nyambura Ndung'u	GDIP
12.	Maria de Brasdefer	IFLA
13.	Maria Kolesnikova	Coordination Center for TLD.ru
14.	Omor Faruque	IGF Dynamic Team Coalition
15.	Peterking Quaye	Liberia IGF
16.	Roberto Zambrana	Former MAG Member, Bolivia IGF
17.	Roddy McGlynn	GSMA
18.	Samuel Jose	MOFA Indonesia
19.	Teddy Woodhouse	OFCOM
20.	Wai Min Kwok	UN DESA

ANNEX A3

Input documents

- 2024 IGF Themes
<https://intgovforum.org/en/content/igf-2024-themes>
- PNMA members of multistakeholder working group
<https://www.intgovforum.org/en/content/pnma-multistakeholder-working-group-0>
- PNMA Repository of Good Practices
<https://intgovforum.org/en/content/pnma-repository>
- 2024 PNMA Meeting I – Slides
https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot_download/256/27754